

V.6. Workforce Plans



Vérificateur général
de la Ville de Montréal

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.	INTRODUCTION.....	245
2.	AUDIT SCOPE	247
3.	FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS AND ACTION PLANS.....	248
	3.1. WMP Process and Tools	248
	3.2. Overview of 2009-2011 Workforce Plans	252
	3.3. WMP Management Structures and Accountability	261
4.	APPENDIX	268
	4.1. List of Highly Vulnerable Corporate Jobs	268

LIST OF ACRONYMS

ACM	associate city manager	SM	senior manager
BD	borough director	WMP	workforce management planning
HR	human resources	WP	workforce plan
MAP	municipal action plan		
SCH	Service du capital humain		

V.6. WORKFORCE PLANS

1. INTRODUCTION

In October 2007, a presentation on retirement forecasts¹ from 2007 to 2012 given by the Service du capital humain (SCH) to the Commission permanente du Conseil municipal sur les finances, les services administratifs et le capital humain² revealed that 3,075 employees, or 10.6%, out of a total workforce of 29,022 permanent and temporary employees of the Ville de Montréal were likely to retire from their jobs. This would represent 16% of the total permanent workforce, or 2,829 permanent employees out of a total of 17,558.

The presentation also reported estimated retirement rates for each borough, central department and job category.

Table 1 shows the business units and job categories with a retirement rate equal to or greater than the critical level, which was set at 15%.³

¹ Based on indicators such as reaching 30 years of seniority or age 65.

² Now known as Commission sur les finances et l'administration.

³ The number of retirements in relation to the business unit's total workforce. SCH based the critical level on specialized human resources publications.

**Table 1—Retirement Forecasts for 2007 to 2012
for Business Units and Job Categories**

2007 Diagnosis – Priorities			
Borough, department or body*		Job category*	
Bureau du vérificateur général	34%	Fire department staff	38%
Pierrefonds-Roxboro borough	20%	Police management	31%
Service des finances	19%	Senior staff	25%
Service de sécurité incendie de Montréal	17%	Senior managers	20%
Direction générale	15%	Administrative managers	16%
Service du capital humain	15%	Professionals other than scientists and general professionals	16%
Outremont borough	15%	Science professionals	15%
Verdun borough	15%		

* Critical level: 15%.
Source: SCH.

Taking these forecasts into account, the SCH determined employment action priorities to be fire department staff, police management and senior staff, whose retirement rates range from 25 to 38%, certain business units, namely the Service des finances, the Service de sécurité incendie de Montréal, and Pierrefonds-Roxboro, Outremont and Verdun boroughs. These forecasts and other factors, such as an aging public service, the Programme d'accès à l'égalité dans l'emploi, and the administration's commitment to review all activities, departments, operations and programs (RASOP), made it necessary to prepare workforce plans (WPs) to deal with these major challenges.

To prepare business units and city administration to meet these challenges, the SCH presented a municipal action plan (MAP), which included a procedure known as "workforce management planning" (WMP) to offer boroughs and central departments support, training and supervision in creating their 2009-2011 WPs.

The city administration's *Plan d'action 2008-2010: Réussir Montréal*,⁴ adopted by the executive committee in July 2008, called the city's aging public service a major human resources issue.

⁴ The city's 2008 budget was based on eight priorities defined in the 2008-2010 action plan. One of these, which concerns WPs, is entitled "Pour une administration encore plus performante."

In order to help implement this action plan, especially the [TRANSLATION] “for an even more effective administration” component, the SCH integrated the following objectives into its 2009-2011 business plan:

- design WPs and prepare a succession plan
- establish corporate support measures for implementing WPs

This was also reflected in the SCH budget documents listing the following WMP-related accomplishments:

- creation of a succession reference framework, guides and tools for preparing WMPs
- coaching boroughs and central departments in preparing their WPs
- producing a summary of city business unit WPs from 2009-2011
- producing a guide for using the Registre des postes for the city’s human resources (HR) units
- implementing training sessions for HR officers on operating the workforce database

In 2010, the SCH focused mainly on coordinating the establishment of corporate support measures and coaching business units on implementing their WPs.

For 2011, the SCH focused on executing corporate measures for highly vulnerable jobs, implementing the talent search program and promoting the city’s image as an employer by offering internships and being present at job fairs and in various educational institutions.

2. AUDIT SCOPE

The purpose of our audit is first to ensure that the strategy followed by the SCH has helped achieve the expected results in its efforts to minimize the negative consequences of massive retirements and second, that WPs based on job categories and borough and central department needs were prepared.

Our audit activities therefore focused mainly on a detailed examination of the documents and tools designed by the SCH to support the WMP process, reports detailing assessments and findings and the 2009-2011 WPs of six business units. We

also met with key SCH staff and people directly involved in preparing the Outremont and Verdun borough WPs.

In addition, to place the WMP in the context of the Direction générale and SCH priorities that prevailed in 2007, we examined both the city's 2008-2010 action plan and its 2009-2011 Business Plan as well as SCH budget documents submitted to the Commission d'étude du budget du conseil municipal for the 2010 and 2011 budgets.

3. FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS AND ACTION PLANS

3.1. WMP PROCESS AND TOOLS

3.1.A. Background and Findings

To ensure that all business units would follow a common, uniform procedure to prepare their WPS, thereby facilitating the preparation of an overall business plan, the SCH proposed a general approach supported by information gathering and analysis tools, including a MAP, which was submitted to the city manager and the business units in June 2008.

This plan, the main activities of which are presented in Table 2, set out a procedure in which business units prepare initial WPs, the 2009-2011 WPs, and then update subsequent WPs annually for 2010-2012, 2011-2013 and so on.

Table 2—Municipal Action Plan

Main activity	Overview of action required	Business unit	Documents to produce and deadlines
1. MAP	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Analysis of internal and external environments Preparation and adoption of MAP MAP and the WMP information tour of business units Presentation to the BD, ACM and SM* Mandate of WMP committees 	SCH	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> MAP June 2008
2. WMP committees and support staff	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Establishment of business unit WMP committees and support staff Training of WMP committee members in each business unit Training of WMP committee support staff 	SCH and business units	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> WMP committee Support staff October 2008
3. WMP process			
3.1. Environmental analysis	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Job market study Study of internal issues (organization, service requests, work conditions and atmosphere, etc.) 	Business units	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Interim report December 2008 WMP database 2009-2011 WP March 2009
3.2. Manpower inventory	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Workforce status and staff profile for each business unit (positions, status, age, retirement date, etc.) 		
3.3. Vulnerability study	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Detection of vulnerable positions and jobs based on retirements, shortages, leaves and internal transfer 		
3.4. Needs forecasting	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Examination of business unit business plans Projected three-year needs 		
3.5. Action and WP priorities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Determination of action priorities (based on timelines and degree of vulnerability) Determination of local and corporate support measures based on vulnerabilities Action plan and 2009-2011 WP 		
4. General summary of work	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Summary of 2009-2011 business unit WPs 2009-2011 corporate support measures plan 	SCH	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Summary of WPs 2009-2011 Corporate Support Measures Plan May 2009
5. Corporate support measures	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Deployment of 2009-2011 corporate support measures Analysis of internal and external environments 	SCH	Starting in June 2009
6. WP review and update	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Annual review and update of WPs for subsequent years 	SCH and business units	Annual

* BD: borough director; ACM: associate city manager; SM: senior manager.

The key elements of this mechanism are the establishment of a WMP committee and internal team in each business unit to support the WMP process. Following completion of the five steps⁵ proposed by the SCH, business units were required to prepare three documents:

- interim report on the progress status of the process at six months

⁵ Environmental analysis (3.1); Manpower inventory (3.2); Vulnerability study (3.3); Needs forecasting (3.4); Action and WP priorities (3.5). See Table 2.

- staff database
- WP (2009-2011)

To coach and support business units in preparing their WPs, the SCH set up a team of HR advisors to work specifically on the WMP project. The SCH also designed and distributed a series of analysis tools to facilitate the process of gathering information, presenting it uniformly and integrating it into a section-based vision, i.e., either by business unit or globally for the whole city. Finally, the SCH prepared and delivered training sessions to WMP committee members and to support staff.

For information purposes, the following is a list of the main WMP tools or models⁶ that the SCH created for the business units:

- Business unit work plans
- Overall assessment of external and internal environments
- Vulnerability exercise scope
- Detailed analysis of external and internal environments
- Sample report: Staff profile, including groups targeted by equal access to employment that are underrepresented in the business unit
- Gathering and analyzing information on staff and positions:
 - Manpower inventory
 - Detection of vulnerabilities
 - Vulnerability report and 2009-2011 support measures
- Analysis of vulnerable jobs or positions
- Employee profile analysis
- Interim report model
- 2009-2011 WP model

Several training sessions were organized by the SCH for business unit WMP committees and support staff. In all, 223 people, including 122 managers, participated in these sessions.

⁶ These tools and models are part of the *Guide d'utilisation des outils de gestion prévisionnelle de la main-d'œuvre* prepared by the SCH.

To facilitate data processing, the SCH created and introduced WMP software into the Registre des postes database in 2010 and designed instructional software for business units to learn the WMP program. This instructional software was distributed to all business units.

Examination of the support tools and models produced by the SCH, experiments with the WMP software tutorial during an exercise simulating the preparation and monitoring of a WP, and comments expressed at our meetings with staff users in two boroughs that we visited (Outremont and Verdun) lead us to conclude that:

- the models, tools and software tutorial provided by the SCH are simple and easy to understand and use
- the training seems to have been appreciated⁷

However, the people we met with in the Verdun borough reported that the first database the SCH gave business units to produce or complete their manpower inventories contained errors. In particular, people who had already retired or had been transferred to another business unit as well as eliminated vacant positions were included in the database. The original information in the WMP program came from the Registre des postes. When the 2009-2011 WPs were being prepared, business units were supposed to update the information contained in the WMP application as well as add information on position vulnerability and support measures. This WMP database was not updated systematically, and consisted of information gathered in 2009, as WPs for 2010-2012 and 2011-2013 were not produced.

It is fundamentally important that the information in this WMP database be valid and that it be updated periodically so that a qualitative and quantitative profile can be established to reflect the reality of staff changes in business units. It is therefore essential that a complete formal verification of all data and information in this database be performed before the 2012-2014 WPs are prepared.

⁷ The SCH did an evaluation of the participants' level of appreciation at each training session, but none of these evaluations was kept.

3.1.B. Recommendations

We recommend that the Service du capital humain and the business units, taking into account their respective responsibilities, make the necessary arrangements to ensure periodic updates of the information in the database used to feed the WMP application so that workforce plans that reflect the true staff situation in each business unit can be created.

3.1.C. Action Plan of the Relevant Business Unit

[TRANSLATION] “Business units will be required to prepare standardized WPs based on the human resources objectives and problems in **highly vulnerable jobs**. A corporate plan will be prepared based on the business units’ plans and the city’s organizational priorities.

In order to do this, the SCH will ensure that the database reflects the existing organizational structure. This will allow each business unit to use the WMP software to obtain an accurate, up-to-date profile of its staff, process all the data and prepare a WP for 2012–2014 based on the weaknesses noted in this profile and forecasts for the next three years. Arrangements will also be made to ensure better follow-up and updating for the plans in accordance with the planned coordination and accountability mechanisms.”
(Planned completion: April 2012)

3.2. OVERVIEW OF 2009-2011 WORKFORCE PLANS

3.2.A. Background and Findings

Preparation of the WPs is the responsibility of the business units, which were required to prepare their 2009-2011 WPs and update the information in the WMP application using the tools provided by the SCH. This effectively means that the business units had to:

- complete and update their own databases
- produce their manpower inventories
- determine the degree of vulnerability (low, medium and high) of each job or position
- propose support measures for each degree of vulnerability.

The procedure in place to produce this information consisted of three steps:

- Business units receive their manpower inventories organized by job categories (managers, professionals, white collars, blue collars, etc.) and by positions (permanents, part-time, etc.).
- Managers within each business unit meet to verify and complete their manpower inventory and examine the vulnerability of positions and individuals as well as the risks of employee departures for:
 - positions (permanent, temporary, strategic or existing positions held by a single individual, etc.)
 - individuals (retirements, promotions, prolonged sick leaves, parental leaves, transfers or foreseeable transfers, etc.)
 - vulnerabilities (classify risks according to their degree of vulnerability [low, medium and high], risk being an expected or unexpected employee departure, a short-, medium- or long-term absence, hiring problems, etc.)
- Business unit managers determine local or corporate support measures to implement to offset the vulnerabilities detected.

Once the WMP committees and support teams were set up in October 2008, business units were required to produce various types of information or documents according to the established schedule, as indicated in the MAP. Table 3 illustrates this process.

Table 3—Municipal Action Plan for 2009-2011 WPs

Activity	Deadline	
	Planned	Actual
1. City manager adopts a MAP <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Visits to business units to present the WMP process to DAs, ACMs and SMs • Mandate of the business units' WMP committees 	June 2008	June 2008
2. Business units establish WMP committees <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Training of business unit WMP committee members • Training of WMP committee support staff 	October 2008	October 2008
3. Project details communicated to all city business units <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Communiqué to all city employees 	October 2008	October 2008
4. WMP implemented by business units <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Interim report • 2009-2011 WP by business units 	December 2008 March 2009	March 2009 May 2009
5. Business unit work summarized and corporate support measures determined <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Summary of the business unit WPs by the SCH • 2009-2011 corporate support measures plan 	May 2009	July 2009 September 2009
6. Corporate support measures created and deployed <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2009-2011 corporate support measures plan 	Starting in June 2009	
7. Annual review and update of business unit WPs	Annual	

Table 4 presents a summary of the documents produced by the business units.

Table 4—Business Units that Produced the Documents Expected for the 2009-2011 WPs

Business unit	Interim report	2009-2011 WP	
		Database	WP
BOROUGHS			
Ahuntsic-Cartierville		Yes	Yes
Anjou	Yes	Yes	Yes
Côte-des-Neiges–Notre-Dame-de-Grâce	Yes	Yes	Yes
L'Île-Bizard–Sainte-Geneviève			
Lachine			
LaSalle			
Mercier–Hochelaga-Maisonneuve	Yes	Yes	Yes
Montréal-Nord			
Outremont	Yes	Yes	
Pierrefonds-Roxboro	Yes	Yes	Yes
Le Plateau-Mont-Royal		Yes	Yes
Rivière-des-Prairies–Pointe-aux-Trembles	Yes	Yes	Yes
Rosemont–La Petite-Patrie	Yes	Yes	Yes
Saint-Laurent		Yes	Yes
Saint-Léonard			
Le Sud-Ouest	Yes	Yes	
Verdun			
Ville-Marie	Yes	Yes	Yes
Villeray–Saint-Michel–Parc-Extension	Yes	Yes	Yes
Number of boroughs that produced the documents requested	10	13	11
Production rate	53%	68%	58%
CENTRAL DEPARTMENTS AND BODIES			
Bureau du vérificateur général			
Commission de la fonction publique	Yes	Yes	Yes
Direction des systèmes d'information	Yes		
Direction générale	Yes	Yes	
Service de la mise en valeur du territoire et du patrimoine		Yes	Yes
Service de police de la Ville de Montréal	Yes		
Service de sécurité incendie de Montréal	Yes	Yes	Yes
Service des affaires corporatives	Yes	Yes	Yes
Service des communications et des relations avec les citoyens	Yes	Yes	
Service des finances		Yes	Yes
Service des infrastructures, transport et environnement		Yes	Yes
Service du capital humain	Yes	Yes	Yes
Service du développement culturel, de la qualité du milieu de vie et de la diversité ethnoculturelle		Yes	Yes
Number of central departments and bodies that produced the documents requested	8	10	8
Production rate	62%	77%	62%
Number of business units that produced the documents requested	18	23	19
Overall production rate	56%	72%	59%

Source: SCH.

Results compiled from reports on the production of interim reports that the SCH produced in April 2009 and the assessment of work carried out in 2010 that it produced in February 2011 generally reveal that:

- 18 business units out of 32 (56%) produced their interim reports, or 10 boroughs out of 19 and 8 central departments and bodies out of 13
- 23 business units out of 32 (72%) updated their databases documenting the 2009-2011 WPs, or 13 boroughs out of 19 and 10 central departments and bodies out of 13
- 19 business units out of 32 (59%) produced their 2009-2011 WPs, or 11 boroughs out of 19 and 8 central departments and bodies out of 13

The following 13 business units did not produce 2009-2011 WPs:

- L'Île-Bizard–Sainte-Geneviève
- Lachine
- LaSalle
- Montréal-Nord
- Outremont
- Saint-Léonard
- Le Sud-Ouest
- Verdun
- Bureau du vérificateur général⁸
- Direction des systèmes d'information
- Direction générale
- Service des communications et des relations avec les citoyens
- Service de police de la Ville de Montréal

It should be noted that five of the business units that did not produce 2009-2011 WPs in 2007 had a projected retirement rate that was equal to or greater than the critical level (15%):

- Outremont borough (15%)
- Verdun borough (15%)

⁸ The WP was prepared at the Bureau du vérificateur général, but was considered to be an internal management document.

- Bureau du vérificateur général (34%)
- Direction générale (15%)
- Service de police de la Ville de Montréal (31%)⁹

For the 2009-2011 WPs produced by the business units, the following significant results are worth noting:

- Determination of jobs or positions classified according to their degree of vulnerability (low, medium or high):
 - 326 jobs out of 2 397, or 14%, were defined as vulnerable; 123 of these are categorized as highly vulnerable jobs by the business units (5% compared to 2 397 city jobs or 37% compared to 326 jobs declared to be vulnerable).
 - 23 of the jobs declared to be highly vulnerable are corporate jobs. Appendix 4.1 lists these jobs.
- Determination of corporate support measures that the SCH will implement.
- Determination of local support measures that the business units will implement.

To analyze highly vulnerable jobs, the SCH has set up three working committees with the units involved to determine the action strategies required locally and at the organizational level.

These committees itemized corporate support measures to be adopted by the SCH (attracting employees, building loyalty, working conditions, job atmosphere, succession plan and employment review).

The SCH then created a 2009-2011 corporate support measures plan, which was confirmed in June 2009 by the steering committee that was set up to make recommendations to the city manager.

⁹ Retirement rate of police executives.

Our examination of all the results of this organizational approach leads us to the following findings:

- To date, the assessment of the business unit production of 2009-2011 WPs is not complete. The city does not, therefore, have an accurate profile of its human resources with respect to the vulnerability status of all staff or jobs. This profile is even more inaccurate in December 2011, considering the various restructuring activities that have taken place since 2010 and the resulting staff transfers.
- Business units did not systematically perform 2009-2011 WP updates as Table 5 illustrates. Updates for the production of 2010-2012 WPs were performed by only 3 business units out of 32 (9%) and by only one business unit out of 32 for the 2011-2013 WPs.

Table 5—Changes in WP Production Rates or Updates since 2009

Business units	2009-2011 WP		2010-2012 WP		2011-2013 WP	
	Database	WP	Database	WP	Database	WP
Boroughs	13	11	2	2	1	1
Production rate	68%	58%	11%	11%	5%	5%
Central departments and bodies	10	8	1	1	0	0
Production rate	77%	62%	8%	8%	0%	0%
Total – Business units	23	19	3	3	1	1
Production rate	72%	59%	9%	9%	3%	3%

Number of boroughs covered: 19.
Number of departments or bodies covered: 13.
Source: SCH.

- Business units are responsible for preparing WPs and updating their databases. The role of the SCH is to coach and advise the business units. However, even though support tools were placed at the business units' disposal, and even though training sessions and assistance were provided by the SCH, the boroughs were still under no obligation to provide the information requested, which might largely explain the lack of commitment shown by some business units and the gradual abandonment

that has been noted. Of course, this situation is not unrelated to the poor results received from all the business units.

Updating the business unit database is the starting point for monitoring changes in staff and preparing a revised WP. Updating is essential to continue producing subsequent WPs. Failure to update the WMP database compromises this monitoring.

Setting up committees to analyze highly vulnerable jobs and their particular characteristics is a worthwhile initiative, because the SCH can rely on business unit expertise and knowledge about the specific nature of these jobs, their requirements and their operating environment.

Preparing and monitoring a 2009-2011 action plan for implementing corporate support measures as well as the establishment and implementation of local support measures are worthwhile initiatives, but they must be based on a periodic monitoring mechanism, and they must be documented.

Several factors currently impact WPs, including:

- mass retirements projected for 2012-2014, especially among executives
- the city's positioning to recover municipal expertise lost in targeted jobs
- the increase of the management-to-staff ratio in the medium term
- equal access to employment
- the hiring freeze
- city budget problems (e.g., pension funds)
- external competitiveness
- ability to attract and retain the best talent, especially in strategic positions

These factors, along with other constraints such as borough autonomy in HR management, expected budget cuts for 2012 and the rationalization of resources (elimination of 1,000 jobs), are making it increasingly necessary for the administration to reaffirm its intention to support the SCH in preparing a WP that will allow it to make strategic choices and take cohesive action in the area of HR management.

This stated support of an organizational WP would also encourage:

- business units, by securing their commitment to the general objectives using sectional WPs that are updated and monitored.
- the SCH, by targeting other actions to help make corporate support measures effective in order to offset large-scale retirements while implementing a mechanism for monitoring and evaluating their medium- and long-term effects.

In short, the Direction générale must make the appropriate arrangements to provide the SCH with the means necessary to exercise its leadership in workforce management, especially in the preparation of an organizational WP, while respecting business unit jurisdictions. These arrangements could be made through:

- section 57.1 of the *Charter of Ville de Montréal*, for a strategic operation
- section 46 of the *Charter of Ville de Montréal*, for a city council resolution that would make WPs mandatory
- an amendment to the *Politique de dotation et de gestion de la main-d'œuvre de la Ville de Montréal*

In brief, the WMP is currently characterized by an incomplete organizational WP, a gradual abandonment of sectional WP production by the business units, an out-of-date database supplying WPs, an incomplete vision of support measures (both corporate and local) that lacks follow-up, and business units that are not required to produce information that is essential to cooperative human resources management.

With respect to this finding, it is important that the Direction générale use every means at its disposal to encourage all business units to help reinforce the current strategy in order to minimize the impact of massive retirements.

3.2.B. Recommendations

We recommend that the Direction générale make appropriate arrangements to obtain information from all business units that will allow the Service du capital humain to prepare an organizational workforce plan to support the *Politique de dotation et de gestion de la main-d'œuvre de la Ville de Montréal*, which was approved by the executive committee on September 28, 2011.

We also recommend that the Direction générale approve the implementation of an organizational strategy that will help minimize the effects of large-scale workforce departures and establish a realistic timeline while taking concrete steps to continue the work already begun to provide high-quality service to all citizens.

With this strategic issue in mind, we recommend that the Service du capital humain report periodically to the Direction générale on the progress of approved strategic projects in relation to the established schedule.

3.2.C. Action Plan of the Relevant Business Unit

- 1) [TRANSLATION] *“The SCH will suggest appropriate means of obtaining the information that will be needed for preparing the WP and keeping it current to the city administration.” (Planned completion: April 2012)*

- 2) [TRANSLATION] *“The SCH will submit for approval an updated corporate strategy and schedule along with accountability mechanisms for implementing the plan that will be selected.” (Planned completion: April 2012)*

- 3) [TRANSLATION] *“The SCH will implement a management score card so that it can effectively monitor the project progress and action taken at both the corporate and local levels (corporate WP). (Planned completion: September 2012)*

Every year, an assessment of actions confirmed in the WPs will be submitted to the Direction générale.” (Planned completion: December 2012)

3.3. WMP MANAGEMENT STRUCTURES AND ACCOUNTABILITY

3.3.A. Background and Findings

The SCH proposed and set up two WMP management structures: one for business units and one for the organizational management of the WMP process. Table 6 summarizes stakeholders' main responsibilities toward the WMP.

Table 6—Roles and Responsibilities

WMP management structures				
Component: business units		Component: organizational		
DA, ACM, SM	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Confirm the WMP committee's mandate • Ratify the 2009-2011 WP • Refer the WP to the borough council or city manager for approval 	City manager	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Approves the process and the MAP • Ensures follow-up 	
WMP committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Refers decisions and the definitive WP to the DA, ACM and SM 	Steering committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Confirms targets and draws up recommendations for the SM of the SCH and the city manager 	
HR team	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Supports managers and the WMP committee with the analytical tools provided by the SCH 	SCH	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Devises the WMP process, tools and guides • Devises the WMP system • Provides manpower inventory data • Creates support measures for business unit WPs 	
Divisions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Implement the WMP process • Confirm the WMP committee's mandate <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Environmental analysis – Manpower inventory – Vulnerability study – Three-year workforce forecasting plan – Establishment of action priorities and a WP 			Through its WMP action group
Management committee Managers				
Business units	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Confirm the process and their commitment • Set up a WMP committee • Implement the process and produce: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – the interim report – the 2009-2011 WP • Have the 2009-2011 WP approved by the borough council or the city manager 			

WMP MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE—BUSINESS UNIT COMPONENT

This structure is designed to ensure that business units prepare and coordinate WPs. For this purpose, the SCH has set up 38 WMP committees with the business units: one in each of the 19 boroughs, the other 19 distributed among the 13 central departments. These WMP committees are assisted by an internal HR team. Each WMP committee

consist of an executive, managers and an HR officer. These WMP committees implement the five-step work included in the WMP process:

- environmental analysis
- manpower inventory
- vulnerability study
- three-year workforce forecast plan
- action priorities and a specific action plan (WP)

A work schedule that the SCH proposed to the business units had production of WPs planned for March 2009, as shown in Table 7.

Table 7—Summary of Actions and Production Schedule for Business Unit WPs

Stakeholders	Action	Schedule
DA, ACM, SM	Appoint WMP committee members	August 2008
	Approve WMP committee work plan	
	Approve interim report	December 2008
	Monitor project progress	
	Approve the 2009-2011 WP	March 2009
	Ensure WP implementation	2009-2011
WMP committee	Choose WMP committee support staff and provide training and guidance	September 2008
	Produce work plan, including communication plan	October 2008
	Implement communication plan	
	Analyze the environment and establish the scope of the vulnerability exercise	
	Have the scope of the vulnerability exercise approved	
	Receive interim report and submit to the DA, ACM and SM	December 2008
	File interim report with the SCH	
	Receive 2009-2011 WP and submit to the DA, ACM and SM	March 2009
Division management committees Managers and support staff	Become familiar with the orientations of the WMP committee and the main issues communicated by management	
	Produce a staff profile (graphics, histograms) and analyze results	
	Meet with the managers involved	
	Establish the preliminary vulnerability findings	
	Prepare the unit's three-year WP for the WMP committee	December 2008
	Update WP data	Ongoing

The timeline also included a mechanism for having key elements, such as the business units' internal work plan, interim reports and 2009-2011 WPs, approved by business unit administrators, who were also responsible for monitoring project progress.

Here are our findings regarding key elements of the business units' roles, responsibilities and actions with respect to the WMP:

- Even though about 60% of the business units produced interim reports and the WPs requested, neither we nor the SCH are able to confirm that the mechanism was monitored, as required.
- In the boroughs we visited, no documents, (detailed work plans, agendas and minutes of working meetings, internal work progress reports) other than the overall project completion schedule prepared by the SCH, were available to show what work and monitoring methods were being used.
- Even though the SCH specified in the WMP guide that the boroughs were required to have their 2009-2011 WPs approved by the borough council and the central departments were required to have their 2009-2011 WPs approved by the city manager, our research shows that only one borough had its interim report and its 2009-2011 WP approved by its borough council.
- The SCH was not able to confirm the approval of 2009-2011 WPs by either the borough councils, or the city manager, as the case may be.

WMP MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE—ORGANIZATIONAL COMPONENT

This structure is organized around the SCH, whose role is to advise and support the business units, design organizational tools and systems, submit the action plan to authorities, spearhead the steering committee, deploy corporate support measures and **report periodically to the city manager.**

Its steering committee, composed mainly of business unit managers, is mandated to confirm targets and formulate recommendations to the SM of the SCH and to the city manager.

In light of the information received, the steering committee's present activities and contributions, after several working meetings, have been devoted mainly to validating or confirming conclusions and drawing up recommendations to the SCH concerning:

- the management framework for succession
- the guide for preparing the succession plan
- MAP
- the summary of interim reports
- assessment of work carried out in 2010
- 2009-2011 corporate support measures plan

Our examination of the organizational component of the WMP management structure in place and our review of documents produced for accountability have led us to the following conclusions:

- The WMP management structure and the documents on the roles and responsibilities of the various entities specified that the steering committee was required to obtain the city manager's approval for the MAP and to report to the city manager periodically regarding its progress. Because no such documentation existed, we were not able to verify whether the then city manager (Mr. Roquet) or his predecessor were formally informed and whether they approved the MAP officially, as required.
- The reports produced by the SCH placed more emphasis on content and appeared to leave aside aspects of follow-up management of a mechanism for producing WPs and implementing support measures. We noted a lack in this area of documents attesting to the regular, systematic monitoring of activities in the business units.
- The fact that the steering committee did not see fit to recommend that the Direction générale consider the WMP to be a strategic issue made it difficult to receive all the information requested and all the WPs from all the business units.
- Four of the business units that did not produce their WPs had managers who were on the steering committee, which had a total of eight members. This finding raises serious questions about the steering committee's collective will to fulfil all its responsibilities, particularly with regard to obtaining those WPs.

In our opinion, the WMP initiative is a large-scale organizational project whose medium- and long-term results will greatly help the city administration achieve its human resources objectives with respect to providing services to citizens. This project must not only be continued and monitored effectively, it must also be provided with a management structure that perfectly integrates:

- local coordination for preparing and updating sectional WPs and following up on local support measures adopted by business units (boroughs and central departments)
- general coordination, under the supervision of the SCH, for consolidating sectional WPs into an organizational WP and for the implementation of corporate support measures, and their follow-up.

In addition to being integrated, these coordination mechanisms must be supported by score cards and periodic reports for each level of responsibility—local (business units) and organizational (SCH)—under the guidance of a coordinating body (steering committee) in an accountability mechanism that allows the Direction générale to follow-up and make the appropriate decisions. Unfortunately, we were not able to note this situation in our audit.

3.3.B. Recommendations

We recommend that the Direction générale review the responsibilities assigned to the steering committee or equivalent committee and establish an appropriate accountability mechanism for following up on policy directions retained by both the Direction générale and the Service du capital humain.

We recommend that the Service du capital humain review the operation of coordination mechanisms and put appropriate score cards in place to remain informed by all business units on the progress of sectional projects for the purpose of establishing an organizational profile that will facilitate decision-making regarding the workforce.

3.3.C. Action Plan of the Relevant Business Unit

- **DIRECTION GÉNÉRALE**

[TRANSLATION] “The SCH will submit for approval updated corporate strategy and schedules, along with accountability mechanisms for implementing the plan that will be selected.” **(Planned completion: April 2012)**

- **SERVICE DU CAPITAL HUMAIN**

[TRANSLATION] “The WMP structure will be revised as follows:

- The sectoral WMP process will be handled by the BD, ACM and SM of each business unit along with the management team.
- Specialist SCH advisors will be appointed to business units to plan the process and assist in preparing WPs, as needed. Business unit HR teams can provide additional support.
- A score card will be designed to monitor project progress in each business unit and the results for highly vulnerable jobs.
- The SCH advisors, with their assigned units, will coordinate the monitoring of management teams accountable for results and, if necessary, WP updating.
- The SCH, with the appointed advisors, will ensure corporate coordination for consolidating sectoral WPs and preparing, completing and monitoring corporate WPs, including support measures.” **(Planned completion: April 2012)**

4. APPENDIX

4.1. LIST OF HIGHLY VULNERABLE CORPORATE JOBS

Table A—Highly Vulnerable Corporate Jobs by Category

Job titles
Executives
Borough director (> 60,000)
Administrative services manager (> 60,000)
Director – Culture, Sports, Loisirs, Développement social
Director – Aménagement urbain et services aux entreprises
White-collar workers
Traffic and parking technical officer
Municipal engineering technical officer
Library technician
Building inspector
Public lands inspector
Budget clerk
Administrative support clerk
Executive secretary
Life guard
Forepersons
Foreperson – Aqueducts and sewers
Foreperson – Horticulture and parks
Foreperson – Sanitation and works (unionized)
Foreperson – Sanitation and works (non-unionized executive)
Professionals
Communications officer
Urban planning advisor
Real estate manager
Financial resources management advisor
Engineer
Blue-collar workers
Plumber

Source: SCH.