

V.1. Follow-Ups to Recommendations from Previous Years



Vérificateur général
de la Ville de Montréal

V. VALUE-FOR-MONEY AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY AUDIT

V.1. FOLLOW-UPS TO RECOMMENDATIONS FROM PREVIOUS YEARS

The percentage of the Auditor General's recommendations that received concrete corrective measures is an essential indicator to ensure that departments and boroughs implement these recommendations promptly.

The policy of the Bureau du vérificateur général (BVG) is to initiate a follow-up to the recommendations the year after they appear in the annual report. The follow-up to the recommendations for a given year generally extends over a maximum period of three years, except in very specific circumstances when some recommendations are monitored for an additional year or two.

The results of the follow-up to the recommendations made in the annual reports for years 2005 to 2010 are shown in Table 1, with the exception of follow-ups related to recommendations involving the Société de transport de Montréal (STM), which we discuss separately at the end of this section.

Table 1—Results of the Follow-Up to the Recommendations

Status of recommendations	Number of recommendations per year						
	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	Total
Completed	182	228	159	62	173	121	925
Under way	–	–	12	3	88	40	143
Deferred	–	–	–	2	3	8	13
Cancelled	6	–	2	1	6	–	15
Not done	9	13	7	2	1	–	32
No longer valid	3	3	2	1	–	–	9
Other*	–	–	–	–	15	6	21
Total number of recommendations made	200	244	182	71	286	175	1,158

* New recommendation.

For recommendations made in 2010, 92% have been “completed” or are “under way” compared with the city administration’s annual objective of 80%.

The follow-up done in March and April 2012 for recommendations made since 2005 showed that 925 were completed, including 198 that were completed during the past 12 months. On a cumulative basis (over the last six years), therefore, close to 80% of recommendations were completed, whereas 12% are under way. This is the highest completion rate in the past six years.

Nevertheless, the results of our follow-up show that 41 of our recommendations were not implemented for the years 2005 to 2010. Among these, 32 are not done and 9 are no longer valid (see Table 2). Although our follow-up cycle for these recommendations is over according to our methodology, we would still ask the Direction générale to ensure that these recommendations are implemented by the units involved. This exercise should, of course, take into consideration the changes that have occurred both with regard to the organizational structure as well as the management systems.

No action has been taken by the units involved for the 21 other recommendations whose status (“other,” new recommendation) has never been updated, even though action plans had initially been sent to us. We would ask the Direction générale to support us once again by ensuring that concrete action is taken by these business units.

Given that most of these recommendations (40 out of 62) are major, their implementation could bring about significant improvements in the management of the city’s activities.

**Table 2—Details on Recommendations Made between 2005 and 2010
with a Status of “Not done”, “No Longer Valid” and “Other”**

Business unit Report title	Annual report	Recommendation status			Recommendation category	
		Not done	No longer valid	Other ¹	Major	Not major
Ahuntsic-Cartierville borough						
Cost Estimates for Public Works Contracts	2006	3			2	1
Côte-des-Neiges–Notre-Dame-de-Grâce borough						
Waste Management (Recyclables)	2005		2		1	1
Lachine borough						
Waste Management (Recyclables)	2005	1	1		1	1
Montréal-Nord borough						
Building Maintenance Management	2005	2				2
Verdun borough						
Building Maintenance Management	2005	6			4	2
Cost Estimates for Public Works Contracts	2006	2			1	1
E-Mail at the Ville de Montréal	2006		2			2
Fleet Management	2009			14	6	8
Service du capital humain						
Management of Occupational Health and Safety	2006		1		1	
SCARM² – Direction de l’approvisionnement						
Collective Purchase Agreement for the Provision and Distribution of Office Supplies	2010			2	2	
SCARM² – Division des relations avec les citoyens – 311						
Management of Work Orders (GDT)	2008	2			1	1
SCARM² – Direction des stratégies et des transactions immobilières						
Faubourg Contrecoeur Project	2009			1	1	
Faubourg Saint-Laurent Project—Phase III Land Sale	2010			2	2	
Direction générale						
Monthly CSST Reports Audit Process and Temporary Assignments	2006	1			1	
Outsourcing Project for Telecommunications Services	2009	1			1	
Direction générale – Greffe						
E-Mail at the Ville de Montréal	2006	1			1	
Follow-Up on Recommendations of the Standing Committees (City Council and Agglomeration Council)	2007	3			3	
SDO³ – Direction de l’environnement et du développement durable						
Contaminated Soil Management	2008		1			1
SDO³ – Direction du développement économique et urbain						
Quartier des spectacles Development Projects	2010			1		1
SDO³ – Administration						
Quartier des spectacles Development Projects	2010			1	1	
Service de l’eau						
Rehabilitation of Water Infrastructure Systems	2006	2			2	
Service de police de la Ville de Montréal						
Service Continuity Plan—Civil Protection	2007	2			2	
Service de sécurité incendie de Montréal						
Fire Prevention Activities	2007	1	2		3	
Service Continuity Plan—Civil Protection	2007	1			1	
Service des technologies de l’information						
Information Processing Centres’ Environment	2006	2			1	1
E-Mail at the Ville de Montréal	2006	2			2	
Total number of recommendations		32	9	21	40	22
			62		62	

¹ New recommendation.

² Service de la concertation des arrondissements et des ressources matérielles.

³ Service du développement et des opérations.

We also followed up on recommendations from the audits involving the STM. These audits dealt with tests of physical intrusion into its facilities and the integrated control system of the Montréal metro. The results of this follow-up are presented separately since the STM is not subject to the accountability methods established by the municipal administration, but by those set by its board of directors. The results of follow-ups to the 17 recommendations issued as part of these audits are presented in Table 3.

**Table 3—Results of the Follow-Up to the
Recommendations in Audits Involving the STM**

Status of recommendations	Number of recommendations
	2010
Completed	5
Under way	9
Deferred	3
Total number of recommendations made	17